

文章编号: 2095-0365(2011) 01-0087-06

# 鲁迅短篇小说《社戏》两个英文译本比较

侯松山, 张兰琴

(军械工程学院 基础部, 河北 石家庄 050003)

**摘要:** 鲁迅是中国现代文学创作的杰出代表。杨宪益和戴乃迭合译的四卷本《鲁迅选集》是鲁迅著作英文译本中篇幅最大、体裁最全面的。英国学者朱莉娅·罗威尔翻译的《鲁迅小说全集》是外国学者中翻译鲁迅小说最全最新的一部。从鲁迅短篇小说《社戏》杨宪益和戴乃迭夫妇的英译本(简称杨译)以及朱莉娅·罗威尔的英译本(简称蓝译)中选取了十个典型译例, 对比分析杨译和蓝译两个文本, 探讨了各自的得失优劣。

**关键词:** 《社戏》; 杨译; 蓝译; 得失优劣

**中图分类号:** H315.9 **文献标识码:** A

## 一、引言

在鲁迅作品的英译本中, 杨宪益和戴乃迭夫妇的译本(简称杨译)已经“成为鲁迅小说英译的权威版本, 在国内外流传广泛, 为鲁迅小说在世界的传播起到了极为重要的作用。”<sup>[1]</sup> 英国学者朱莉娅·罗威尔(Julia Lovell)(中文名: 蓝诗玲)以1982年人民文学出版社出版的《鲁迅全集》为底本, 完成了《鲁迅小说全集》(*The Real Story of Ah Q and Other Tales of China: The Complete Fiction of Lu Xun*)的英译工作。2009年11月, 该书由英国企鹅出版社出版, 收录了鲁迅三部小说集的所有小说(简称蓝译)。蓝氏也因此成为“外国学者中翻译鲁迅小说最全的一位学者。”<sup>[1]</sup> 当然, 蓝氏译本也是鲁迅作品英译本中最新的一部。

通过文献检索发现, 国内关于鲁迅作品英译的研究还是相对较少, 以小说《社戏》的英译本为研究对象的则更少。孟伟根从杨译的鲁迅《风波》、《阿Q正传》、《社戏》、《药》、《狂人日记》、《肥皂》和《离婚》等七篇短篇小说中选取了十七个典型译例, 重点探讨了鲁迅小说中方言词语的英译问题, 其中选自《社戏》的译例, 分析了杨译用英语“push”和“squeeze”, 处理绍兴方言“挨”和“挤”的

妙处。<sup>[2]</sup>

不过, 迄今为止, 尚未见以蓝译为研究对象的相关文章发表。通过分析选自小说《社戏》的杨译本和蓝译本的十个具体译例, 探讨两个译本的得失优劣(各例原文和译文中的下划线及粗体均为笔者所加)。

## 二、译例比较与分析

### (一) 杨译优于蓝译举例

例一: “我写包票!”<sup>[3]</sup>

杨译: “I guarantee it I'll be all right!”<sup>[4]</sup>

蓝译: “I'll make sure he's all right!”<sup>[5]</sup>

按照《通用惯用语词典》的解释, “保票, 即保单。旧时为保证他人的行为和财力而写的字据。”“打保票”也写作“打包票”, “比喻有绝对的把握。”<sup>[6]</sup> 杨译选用的“guarantee”一词意思是“to promise that something will happen, **especially because you are going to make sure that nothing goes wrong**, or promise that something is definitely true and you have checked this very carefully”。<sup>[7]</sup> 蓝译选用的“make sure”则表示“to do sth in order to be certain that something else happens”。<sup>[8]</sup> 原著前文交待, 因为要划船去看戏,

外祖母和母亲都担心“我”的安全。为此,为了打消她们的疑虑,小说中的另一个人物双喜说了句“我写包票!”,并列举了三个有利因素。从上述释义看,“guarantee”有确保不出任何差错的含义,语气比“make sure”更强烈,因而杨译显得更好些。

例二:“都回来了!那里会错。我原说过写包票的!”<sup>[3]</sup>

杨译:“We are all back! How could anything go wrong? Didn't I guarantee that?”<sup>[4]</sup>

蓝译:“We're back!”...“Safe and sound. Didn't I say we'd be fine?”<sup>[5]</sup>

就本例而言,蓝译不如杨译,原因有三:一是原文“都”字在蓝译中没有体现出来。可以设想,“我”乘船出去看戏,“我”的外祖母和母亲肯定不仅担心“我”的安全,而且也会担心陪“我”去看戏的其他孩子们的安全。她们肯定希望我们返回时一个不少,全部平安。另外,双喜说“都回来了”,也有“看,我双喜说话算数兑现承诺吧”之类的含义。可见,一个“都”字,对刻画双喜这个人物形象,也起到了不小的作用。因此,翻译时“都”字不能少。二是原文“那里会错”用的是反问语气,能反映出双喜的得意和自豪。杨译形、神兼备,用“How could anything go wrong?”,把原著意思和语气都准确传递了出来。蓝译选用的“Safe and sound”,尽管可以反映“平平安安,安全无恙”的意思,但语气不如杨译。三是关于“写包票”的译法。小说中“写包票”共出现过三次,蓝译采用了三种不同的译法,估计考虑表达多样性的成分多些。看戏前,双喜说“我写包票!”,承诺确保“我”的安全。说过此话后,双喜就成了“我”安全的第一责任人。看完戏回来后,他又说“我原说过写包票的!”,言外之意是“我双喜保证过的,说没事就没事”,进一步凸显其自信和得意,也显露出他敢于担当的精神。而蓝译“Didn't I say we'd be fine?”的意思是“我不是说过我们不会有事的吗?”,与“我原说过写包票的!”差别不小。此处杨译重复使用了“guarantee”一词,既准确传递原意,又照应了上文。

例三:……但也就高兴了,笑着邀大家去吃炒米。<sup>[3]</sup>

杨译:…and smilingly invited everyone to go and have some puffed rice.<sup>[4]</sup>

蓝译:…smiling and inviting everyone back

for fried rice.<sup>[5]</sup>

所谓“炒米”指的就是江、浙一带常见的“炸炒米”。一位署名“长江长城长”的博主在其题为《炸炒米》的博文里有一段精彩的描写:“‘炸炒米了,炸炒米……’。农闲时节,庄子上的杨二爹就挑着一副担子,一路吆喝着在巷口摆开摊子,一台煤炉、一只风箱、一口摇锅,旁边还放了个大大的、开口处连接着布袋子的铁丝笼子。那时的孩子没有零食可吃,每次看到炸炒米的,就吵着跟家人要玉米或饭米来炸。虽说饭米家家都有,但几角钱的加工费,却不是每个父母都愿意花的,因为几角钱可以打酱油、买火柴等等,算起来还可以抵作不少家用呢。……看到指示仪上的温度到了,老人便站起身。孩子们哗地一下向后退去,远远地让出一片空地,赶紧用双手捂住耳朵。老人麻利地把铁锅从炭火上提下来,用火钩搭住另一头。拿到笼子前,把锅放进袋口,用脚一踩,不知道触动了什么机关,只听‘嘭’的一声,一股股令人垂涎欲滴的浓香喷涌而出,米花随着热气膨胀的冲力一下子喷到铁丝笼里了。”<sup>[9]</sup>

不难看出,“炒米”的加工主要是靠摇锅中产生的“热气膨胀的冲力”。英文“fry”的意思是“to cook sth in hot fat or oil 油炸;油煎;油炒”<sup>[8]</sup>这样一来,蓝译的“fried rice”则成了“油炸(油煎或油炒)米”,显然有悖于原文,实属误译。在这一点上,杨译选用的“puffed”一词含有“鼓起来;膨胀起来”的意思,因之“puffed rice”更加精确贴切,胜过一筹。

## (二) 蓝译优于杨译举例

例四:但在我是乐土:因为我在这里不但得到优待,又可以免念“秩秩斯干幽幽南山”了。<sup>[3]</sup>

杨译:To me, however, it was heaven, for not only was I treated as a guest of honour but here I could skip reading the Book of Songs.<sup>[4]</sup> [The earliest anthology of poetry in China and part of every school curriculum.]

蓝译:But I always enjoyed these visits: everyone invariably made the most tremendous fuss of me, and I gained a few days respite from my dusty Confucian texts.<sup>[5]</sup>

“秩秩斯干幽幽南山”语见《诗经·小雅·斯干》,意为“涧溪水,清澄澄;南山里,多幽深。”<sup>[10]</sup>。杨译用“秩秩斯干幽幽南山”泛指《诗

经》,所以译成 *Book of Songs*, 并加注解。杨译的处理难免给人如下感觉:“我”可以“免念”《诗经》,但别的儒学经典还是免不了的。

一提起儒学,人们往往会想到十三经。根据《辞海》的解释,“汉代开始,把以《诗》、《书》、《易》、《礼》、《春秋》称为‘五经’。唐代把《周礼》、《礼记》、《仪礼》、《公羊传》、《穀梁传》、《左传》与《诗》、《书》、《易》称为‘九经’。唐文宗刻石经,将《孝经》、《论语》、《尔雅》列入经部。宋代又将《孟子》列入,因有十三经之称。”<sup>[11]</sup> 这里的《诗》指的就是《诗经》。可见,蓝译用“秩秩斯干幽幽南山”泛指儒学典籍(Confucian texts),也是完全说得通的。关于“免”字翻译,杨译选用的“skip”一词表示“not to do sth that you usually do or should do 不做(应该做的事等;不参加)”。<sup>[8]</sup> 蓝译选用的词“respite”的意思是“a short break or escape from sth difficult or unpleasant 暂停;暂缓”。<sup>[8]</sup> 因此,相比之下,蓝译“信、达、雅”兼备,更好地传递了原著含义,堪称佳译精典。

例五:两岸的豆麦和河底的水草所发散出来的清香,夹杂在水气中扑面的吹来;月色便朦胧在这水气里。<sup>[3]</sup>

杨译:The scent of beans, wheat and river-weeds wafted towards us through the mist, and the moonlight shone faintly through it.<sup>[4]</sup>

蓝译:Fresh, vegetable scents of beans and waterweed mingled with the mist rising off the river, hazily enveloping the moon.<sup>[5]</sup>

原文“月色便朦胧在这水气里”其实是一个被动句,意思是月亮被笼罩在水气里,看上去朦朦胧胧的。杨译“and the moonlight shone faintly through it”采用的是一个主动句,基本传达了原意。蓝译选用的“envelop”是一个正式用语,其释义为“to wrap sb/sth up or cover them or it completely”,并举了一个例子:“Clouds enveloped the mountain tops.”。<sup>[8]</sup> 我们认为,蓝译“hazily enveloping the moon”更加准确地传达出了“水雾笼罩、月色朦胧”这一美好意境。

例六:果然近不得台旁,大家只能下了篙,比那正对戏台的神棚还要远。<sup>[3]</sup>

杨译:True enough, it was impossible to get close to the stage. We had to make fast even further away from it than the shrine opposite.<sup>[4]</sup>

蓝译:As there was indeed no way of getting

a closer viewing position, everyone set down their oars. The shrine over the way set up alongside the stage to allow the gods to enjoy the performance was closer to the opera than we were.<sup>[5]</sup>

“神棚”是一个文化负载词。在不参考注解的情况下,那些不熟谙中国文化的外国读者恐怕很难从“shrine”一词,准确理解原著“神棚”的含义。通过添加“set up alongside the stage to allow the gods to enjoy the performance”这13个词的注解,蓝译更加清楚地交待了“神棚”的搭建位置及其相关功能,而杨译并没有作类似额外的加工处理,略逊于蓝译。

### (三) 杨译蓝译各有千秋

例七:听说他还对母亲极口夸奖我,说“小小年纪便有见识,将来一定要中状元。姑奶奶,你的福气是可以写包票的了。”<sup>[3]</sup>

杨译:And I heard he had praised me highly to Mother, saying “He’s so young, yet he knows what’s what. He’s sure to come first in the official examinations in the future. Your fortune’s as good as made, ma’am.”<sup>[4]</sup>

蓝译:He’d praised me to the skies, Mother reported: “Wise before his time—he’ll come top of the examinations, top of the empire. Mark my words!”<sup>[5]</sup>

尽管六一公公对“我”母亲所讲的只是一番恭维话,但仔细分析起来,我们发现它是三环相扣的。在六一公公看来,因为“我”打小有见识(一环),将来一定中状元(二环)。因为“我”会中状元(二环),“我”母亲一定能享上福(三环)。我们先看“小小年纪便有见识”的译法。按照《麦克米伦高阶英语词典》的解释,杨译选用的“what’s what”意思是“the important facts that you should understand about a situation.”。该辞典还举了一个例子:“He’s worked in the insurance business all his life, so he knows what’s what.”。<sup>[12]</sup> 而蓝译所用成语“before one’s time”的释义是“before the usual time in sb’s life when sth happens”。比较而言,蓝译“Wise before his time”,比杨译更简练,似乎也更精确些。再看“你的福气是可以写包票的了”的译法。杨译成语“as good as”的意思是“very nearly 与……几乎一样;

几乎;简直是”,<sup>[8]</sup>并用“fortune”将“福气”译出,可谓一一对应,中规中矩。蓝译并没有译出“福气”二字,显然是失去了关键信息(三环)。不过,蓝译选用的成语表达力更强。“‘mark my words’ [is] used for telling someone to listen carefully to what you are saying, especially because you will be proved right in the future”。<sup>[12]</sup>通过“Mark my words!”的运用,读者仿佛不仅能想象出六一公公在“我”母亲面前极口夸奖“我”时的样子,而且仿佛能够听到他的声音。

例八:我买了一张票,本是对于**劝募人聊以塞责的**,然而似乎又有好事家乘机**对我说了些叫天不可不看的大法要了**。<sup>[3]</sup>

杨译:I bought a ticket primarily to satisfy the collector, but then some busybody seized the chance to tell me why Tan Xinpei simply had to be seen.<sup>[4]</sup>

蓝译:Once I bought a ticket, mainly to get the fundraiser to leave me in peace, some other busybody began lecturing me on the unmissable talents of the great Tan.<sup>[5]</sup>

成语“聊以塞责”的意思是“姑且来应付一下,算是交待了自己的责任。”<sup>[13]</sup>从小说人物“我”的角度看,面对劝捐的人,自己掏钱买一张戏票,一方面算是应付了劝捐人,另一方面也算是尽到自己应尽的职责了。杨译“to satisfy the collector”虽不能完全表原著含义,但还是远好于蓝译的“to get the fundraiser to leave me in peace”,因为蓝译给读者的印象是“我”似乎有点厌烦劝捐人,希望劝捐人别打扰自己。而从原著看,“我”知晓捐款是为了帮助湖北遭水灾的灾民,而且“我”也有责任尽绵薄之力。我们认为,如果“我”真地有点不耐烦的话,那么所冲对象也应该是那位“好事家”,而不应该是劝捐人。

原文“叫天”指的是当时有“小叫天”之称的京剧老生演员谭鑫培。关于“对我说了些叫天不可不看的大法要了”的翻译,杨译“to tell me why Tan Xinpei simply had to be seen”虽直白达意,但略显平淡。相比之下,蓝译“lecturing me on the unmissable talents of the great Tan”要好得多。英语“lecture sb on sth”的意思是“to criticize sb or tell them how you think they should behave, especially when it is done in an annoying way(尤指恼人地)指责;训斥;告诫”。<sup>[8]</sup>而“un-

missable”的释义为“that you must not miss because it is so good 不能错过的;不能失掉的”。<sup>[8]</sup>通过“lecture”和“unmissable”这两个词的运用,蓝氏精准地传递了原著的精髓,使得那个令人生厌的“好事家”的形象跃然纸上。

例九:这一夜,就是**我对于中国戏告了别**的一夜,此后再没有想到他,即使偶而经过戏园,我们也漠不相关,精神上早已**一在天之南一在地之北**了。<sup>[3]</sup>

杨译:I said goodbye to Chinese opera that night, never thinking about it again, and if by any chance passed a theatre it meant nothing to me for in spirit we were long since poles apart.<sup>[4]</sup>

蓝译:That night, I bade farewell for ever to Chinese opera. And for years, I never gave it so much as a thought, striding obliviously past the capital's theatres as if they existed in a parallel dimension.<sup>[5]</sup>

成语“天南地北”形容“相隔遥远”。<sup>[13]</sup>而原文“天之南”“地之北”实际上是它的一个变体。但是,鲁迅在此使用它的意思并不是指地理上的距离,而应该理解成心理上的感受:“我”对戏园及中国戏不再关心,也没有任何兴趣可言。“People, beliefs, or ideas that are worlds or poles apart are so completely different that there is almost nothing about them that is similar”,这是 *Longman Language Activator* 关于成语“be worlds apart/be poles apart”的解释。<sup>[7]</sup>据此发现,“be poles apart”主要是指两者截然不同,相似点极少。根据网页 [http://www.redbubble.com/groups/parallel\\_dimensions](http://www.redbubble.com/groups/parallel_dimensions) 所提供的释义,蓝译“parallel dimension”是指“another world existing alongside our own, a differing reality that could be eerily similar or something entirely different”。<sup>[14]</sup>可见,蓝译和杨译思路一致,意思相差无几,都局限于原文的字面意思。这两种译法都没能准确全面地传递原文含义。

例十:双喜说,那就是有名的铁头老生,能连翻八十四个筋斗,他**日里亲自数过的**。<sup>[3]</sup>

杨译:Shuangxi told us this was a famous acrobat who could turn eighty-four somersaults one after the other. He had counted for himself earlier in the day.<sup>[4]</sup>

蓝译: This, Shuangxi told me, was the celebrated acrobat Iron Head. He could turn eighty-four somersaults in a row — Shuangxi had counted them for himself earlier in the day.<sup>[5]</sup>

关于“日里”译法,上述两个版本一样,都译成了“earlier in the day”。这种译法容易产生歧义,因为它也可以理解成“白天早些时候”。而按照原著交待,“总之,是完了。到下午,我的朋友都去了,戏已经开场了,我似乎听到锣鼓的声音,而且知道他们在戏台下买豆浆喝。”<sup>[3]</sup>由此可知,“我”的朋友们白天看戏的时间是下午。如果我们把“earlier in the day”改成“in the afternoon”,将更加直白,也可避免歧义。

### 三、结语

杨宪益先生在其回忆录中曾写道:“我的译作中最有分量的一部可能是现代中国最重要的作家和思想家鲁迅的四卷本选集。”<sup>[15]</sup>蓝诗玲在《中国的良心》(*China's Conscience*)一文中,也高度评价了鲁迅,称“鲁迅是集狄更斯和乔伊斯于一身的

中国作家。”(Lu Xun is China's Dickens and Joyce rolled into one.)<sup>[16]</sup>开展对鲁迅作品英译本更加广泛深入的研究,是一件十分有意义的工作。正如彼得·纽马克(Peter Newmark)所言,“Translation criticism is an essential link between translation theory and its practice; it is also an enjoyable and instructive exercise, particularly if you are criticizing someone else's translation or, even better, two or more translations of the same text.”<sup>[17]</sup>

通过对鲁迅短篇小说《社戏》两个英译本的比较,发现翻译批评(translation criticism)这项工作,的确既有“趣味(enjoyable)”又有“教益(instructive)”。杨译有其自身长处,蓝译也不乏创新。这些长处和创新,既带来了阅读的愉悦,又增长了学识。不管怎么说,读者都应感谢这两个译本的三位译家,因为他们全都“为鲁迅研究这门学问具有一定的国际规模做出了贡献”。<sup>[15]</sup>

### 参考文献:

- [1] 杨坚定,孙鸿仁.鲁迅小说英译版本综述[J].鲁迅研究月刊,2010(4):49-52.
- [2] 孟伟根.鲁迅小说中方言词语的英译评析——鲁迅著作杨、戴英译本学习札记[J].绍兴文理学院学报,2003(5):34-38.
- [3] 鲁迅.鲁迅全集(第一卷)[M].北京:人民文学出版社,1982:560,561,562,563,564,565,568,569.
- [4] 鲁迅.鲁迅选集(一)[M].杨宪益,戴乃迭,译.2版.北京:外文出版社,1980:156,157,158,161,162,165,166,167.
- [5] Lovell, J. The Real Story of Ah Q and Other Tales of China: The Complete Fiction of Lu Xun [M]. Penguin Books, 2009: 149, 150, 151, 153, 154, 157, 158.
- [6] 温端政,沈慧云.通用惯用语词典[Z].北京:语文出版社,2002:11,28,29.
- [7] Summers, D. Longman Language Activator [Z]. Longman Group UK Limited, 1993/Shanghai Foreign Language Education Press, 1997: 337, 1040.
- [8] 霍恩比.牛津高阶英汉双解词典(第7版)[Z].王玉章,译.北京:商务印书馆,2009:669,879,1152,1699,1881,2209,2302.
- [9] 长江长城长.炸炒米[EB/OL]. [2010-06-07]. [http://blog.sina.com.cn/s/blog\\_4a545e140100j551.html](http://blog.sina.com.cn/s/blog_4a545e140100j551.html).
- [10] 金启华.诗经全译[M].江苏古籍出版社,1984:432.
- [11] 辞海编辑委员会编.辞海(1989年版)缩印本[Z].上海:上海辞书出版社,1990:128.
- [12] 麦克米伦出版有限公司编.麦克米伦高阶英语词典[Z].北京:外语与教学研究出版社,2003:874,1630.
- [13] 梅萌.汉语成语大全[Z].北京:商务印书馆国际有限公司,2007:926.
- [14] 佚名. parallel dimensions [EB/OL]. [2010-10-22]. <http://www.redbubble.com/groups/parallel-dimensions>.
- [15] 黄乔生.杨宪益与鲁迅著作英译[J].海内与海外,2010(1):12-16.
- [16] Lovell, J. China's Conscience [EB/OL]. [2010-06-12]. <http://www.guardian.co.uk/books/2010/jun/12/rereading-julia-lovell-lu-xun>.
- [17] (英)纽马克(Newmark, P.).翻译教程:英文[M].上海:上海外语教育出版社,2001:184.

A Contrastive Study on Two English Versions of Lu Xun’s Short Story  
*Village Opera*

HOU Song-shan, ZHANG Lai-qin

(Department of Basic Courses, Ordnance Engineering College, Shijiazhuang 050003, China)

**Abstract:** Lu Xun is an outstanding representative in modern Chinese literature. The four-volume *Lu Xun Selected Works* translated by Yang Xianyi and Gladys Yang (called Yang’s version for short) is the largest in the number of works included and the most comprehensive in the genre. British scholar Julia Lovell (named Lan Shiling in Chinese) is the foreign scholar whose English version of *The Real Story of Ah-Q and Other Tales of China: The Complete Fiction of Lu Xun* is the most complete collection of Lu Xun’s stories and the most recent one (called Lan’s version for short). On the basis of ten typical examples taken from the two English versions of Lu Xun’s story *Village Opera* and Julia Lovell, the authors conduct a contrastive study on the English language used in their translations, and tentatively point out their strengths and weaknesses.

**Key words:** *Village Opera*; Yang’s version; Lan’s version; strengths and weaknesses

(上接第 46 页)

[4] 郑贵华. 税务筹划理论与实务[M]. 长沙: 国防科技大学出版社, 2002. [6] 周赞, 唐炜. 浙江中小民营企业财务管理现状分析[J]. 价格月刊. 2008(7).

[5] 计金标. 纳税筹划[M]. 北京: 中国人民大学出版社, 2006.

Private Enterprise Tax Planning Risk and Prevention Strategies

ZHANG Jing-dong

(Finance Department of Handan City Bureau of Education, Handan 056002, China)

**Abstract:** With the limitations in scale, capital, personnel quality and financing channels, the tax planning methods and risks of private enterprises are different from transnational corporations and state-owned large and medium enterprises. Private enterprises must establish risk awareness in tax planning, carefully analyze possible risk factors and take the appropriate measures and strategies in order to achieve the expected goal of tax planning.

**Key words:** private enterprises tax planning risk; preventive strategies

(上接第 81 页)

Two Trains of Thought in Anti-essentialism Literature  
Theory in Western Context

——Derrida and Wittgenstein

YAN Ting<sup>1</sup>, LI Sen<sup>2</sup>

(1. School of Literature, Hebei Normal University, Shijiazhuang 050024, China;

2. School of Music, Hebei Normal University, Shijiazhuang 050024, China)

**Abstract:** Anti-essentialism in literature theory knowledge construction has two ways: one is the thinking of withstanding metaphysics, represented by Nietzsche, Heidegger and Derrida. The other is the concept investigation of “family resemblance”, represented by Wittgenstein. Reflecting on the two ways, we can know deeply that the essence of literature is a value judgment. Whether in literature theory or cultural theory, the most important thing is how to develop democratic and pluralistic theory construction in recent new historical condition.

**Key words:** anti-essentialism; literature theory; Derrida; Wittgenstein